

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

**IN RE: GENERIC PHARMACEUTICALS  
PRICING ANTITRUST LITIGATION**

**MDL 2724  
16-MD-2724**

**THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:**

***ALL ACTIONS***

**HON. CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ**

**ORDER**

**AND NOW**, this 12th day of April 2023, upon consideration of the attached Joint Stipulation Concerning Protocol for Conferences during Certain Depositions, which incorporates the informal recommendation of the Special Discovery Master, it is hereby **ORDERED** that the Joint Stipulation is **APPROVED**.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

**BY THE COURT:**

**/s/ Cynthia M. Rufe**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ, J.**

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

IN RE: GENERIC PHARMACEUTICALS  
PRICING ANTITRUST LITIGATION

MDL No. 2724  
Case No. 2:16-MD-02724

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:  
*ALL ACTIONS*

Hon. Cynthia M. Rufe

**JOINT STIPULATION CONCERNING  
PROTOCOL FOR CONFERENCES DURING CERTAIN DEPOSITIONS**

WHEREAS, Cooperating Witnesses (“CWs”) 1 and 4 have expressed a concern that their deposition testimony may have criminal implications, given their status as cooperating witnesses in this Multi-District Litigation (“MDL”) and the existence of parallel criminal proceedings; and

WHEREAS, the aforementioned concerns may cause CWs 1 and 4 to want to consult with their counsel during their deposition testimony; and

WHEREAS, in light of precedent in this District and practice to date in this Multi-District Litigation limiting conferences between deponents and counsel during depositions – specifically, *Hall v. Clifton Precision*, 150 F.R.D. 525 (E.D. Pa. 1993) – CW-1 and CW-4 moved to permit, during breaks and recesses of their depositions, communications with their own counsel concerning the subject matter of the deposition for the purpose of seeking and receiving legal advice relating to the criminal proceedings, and for those communications to remain protected by the attorney-client privilege; and

WHEREAS, CWs 1 and 4 and the Defendants brought the issue to Special Master Merenstein, who on January 17, 2023 issued an informal report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS, CWs 1 and 4 and the Defendants (each a “Party” and collectively the “Parties”) have agreed to accept the informal report and recommendation, subject to, in light of *Hall*, the Court issuing an Order confirming the recommended protocol; and

WHEREAS, the stipulated order below duplicates Special Discovery Master Merenstein’s informal report and recommendation verbatim; and

WHEREAS, the Parties have further agreed that recesses that extend beyond overnight (*i.e.*, for a day or longer) shall be treated the same as an overnight recess; and

WHEREAS, the Parties reserve all rights in connection with any matter not addressed by Special Discovery Master Merenstein in connection with the above-described discovery dispute.

NOW THEREFORE, pursuant to Local Rule 7.4(b), the Parties hereby stipulate to the following:

1. Counsel for CW-1 and CW-4 is prohibited from consulting with the deponent, except to determine whether a privilege should be asserted, during any break or recess in the witnesses’ depositions other than any overnight recess.

2. Counsel for CW-1 and CW-4 may consult with the deponent during any overnight recess regarding the potential criminal implications of the deponent’s testimony.

3. Upon resumption of a deposition after an overnight recess, questioning counsel may inquire of the deponent regarding any consultation with counsel in order to place on the record that the witness consulted with counsel and to establish the subject-matter and nature of any such discussions, but may not inquire into the specifics of any privileged communications.

IT IS SO STIPULATED.

Dated: April 11, 2023

/s/ Adam Cohen

Adam Cohen  
WALDEN MACHT & HARAN LLP  
250 Vesey Street, 27th Floor  
New York, New York 10281  
O: (212) 335-2037  
F: (212) 335-2040  
acohen@wmhlaw.com

*Attorney for CW-1 and CW-4*

/s/ Zachary M. Johns

J. Gordon Cooney, Jr.  
Alison Tanchyk  
John J. Pease, III  
William T. McEnroe  
Zachary M. Johns  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
1701 Market Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
(215) 963-5000  
(215) 963-5001 (fax)  
gordon.cooney@morganlewis.com  
alison.tanchyk@morganlewis.com  
john.pease@morganlewis.com  
william.mcenroe@morganlewis.com  
zachary.johns@morganlewis.com

Amanda Robinson  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
(202) 739-3000  
(202) 739-3001 (fax)  
amanda.robinson@morganlewis.com

*Attorneys for Defendant  
Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc.*

/s/ Robin P. Sumner

Robin P. Sumner  
Michael J. Hartman  
TROUTMAN PEPPER HAMILTON  
SANDERS LLP

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Sheron Korpus

Sheron Korpus  
Seth A. Moskowitz  
Seth Davis  
David M. Max  
KASOWITZ BENSON TORRES LLP  
1633 Broadway  
New York, New York 10019  
Telephone: (212) 506-1700  
skorpus@kasowitz.com  
smoskowitz@kasowitz.com  
sdavis@kasowitz.com  
dmax@kasowitz.com

*Counsel for Defendants Actavis Elizabeth, LLC,  
Actavis Holdco U.S., Inc., and Actavis Pharma,  
Inc.*

/s/ Robin D. Adelstein

Robin D. Adelstein  
Mark A. Robertson  
NORTON ROSE FULBRIGHT US LLP  
1301 Avenue of the Americas

3000 Two Logan Square  
Eighteenth and Arch Streets  
Philadelphia, PA 19103-2799  
Tel. (215) 981-4000  
Fax. (215) 981-4750

*Attorneys for Defendants Hikma  
Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Hikma Labs,  
Inc., West-Ward Columbus Inc., Amneal  
Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Amneal  
Pharmaceuticals LLC, Impax  
Laboratories, Inc., and Impax  
Laboratories, LLC*

/s/ Benjamin H. Diessel  
Benjamin H. Diessel  
Jenny R. Chou  
Emmett Gilles  
WIGGIN AND DANA LLP  
One Century Tower  
265 Church Street  
New Haven, CT 06510  
Tel: (203) 498-4400  
Fax: (203) 782-2889  
bdiessel@wiggin.com  
jchou@wiggin.com  
egilles@wiggin.com

Nathan E. Denning  
WIGGIN AND DANA LLP  
437 Madison Avenue, 35th Floor  
New York, NY 10022  
Tel: (212) 551-2600  
Fax (212) 551-2888  
ndenning@wiggin.com

*Counsel for Defendant Aurobindo  
Pharma USA, Inc.*

/s/ James W. Matthews  
James W. Matthews  
Katy E. Koski  
John F. Nagle  
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP  
111 Huntington Avenue  
Boston, Massachusetts 02199

New York, NY 10019-6022  
Telephone: (212) 318-3000  
Facsimile: (212) 408-5100  
robin.adelstein@nortonrosefulbright.com  
mark.robertson@nortonrosefulbright.com

*Counsel for Defendants Bausch Health  
Americas, Inc. (formerly known as Valeant  
Pharmaceuticals International), Bausch  
Health US, LLC (formerly known as Valeant  
Pharmaceuticals North America LLC), and  
Oceanside Pharmaceuticals, Inc.*

/s/ Stacey Anne Mahoney  
Stacey Anne Mahoney  
Grant R. MacQueen  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
101 Park Avenue  
New York, New York 10178  
Telephone: (212) 309-6000  
Facsimile: (212) 309-6001  
stacey.mahoney@morganlewis.com  
grant.macqueen@morganlewis.com

*Counsel for Defendant Breckenridge  
Pharmaceutical, Inc.*

/s/ Steven E. Bizar  
Steven E. Bizar  
John P. McClam  
Tiffany E. Engsell  
DECHERT LLP  
Cira Centre  
2929 Arch Street

Tel: (617) 342-4000  
Fax: (617) 342-4001  
jmatthews@foley.com  
kkoski@foley.com  
jnagle@foley.com

James T. McKeown  
Elizabeth A. N. Haas  
Kate E. Gehl  
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP  
777 E. Wisconsin Avenue  
Milwaukee, WI 53202  
Tel: (414) 271-2400  
Fax: (414) 297-4900  
jmckeown@foley.com  
ehaas@foley.com  
kgehl@foley.com

Steven F. Cherry  
April N. Williams  
Claire Bergeron  
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING  
HALE AND DORR LLP  
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 663-6000  
Fax: (202) 663-6363  
steven.cherry@wilmerhale.com  
april.williams@wilmerhale.com  
claire.bergeron@wilmerhale.com

Terry M. Henry  
Melanie S. Carter  
BLANK ROME LLP  
One Logan Square  
130 North 18th Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Tel: (215) 569-5644  
Fax: (215) 832-5644  
THenry@blankrome.com  
MCarter@blankrome.com

*Counsel for Defendant Apotex Corp.*

Philadelphia, PA 19104  
(215) 994-4000  
steven.bizar@dechert.com  
john.mcclam@dechert.com  
tiffany.engsell@dechert.com

*Counsel for Citron Pharma LLC*

/s/ W. Gordon Dobie

W. Gordon Dobie  
WINSTON & STRAWN LLP  
35 W. Wacker Dr.  
Chicago, IL 60601  
Tel: (312) 558-5600  
Fax: (312) 558-5700  
WDobie@winston.com

Irving Wiesen  
LAW OFFICES OF IRVING L.  
WIESEN, P.C.  
420 Lexington Avenue - Suite 2400  
New York, NY 10170  
Tel: (212) 381-8774  
Fax: (646) 536-3185  
iwiesen@wiesenlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Ascend  
Laboratories, LLC*

/s/ Margaret A. Rogers

Margaret A. Rogers  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE  
SCHOLER LLP  
250 West 55th Street  
New York, NY 10019-9710  
Telephone: (212) 836-8000  
Facsimile: (212) 836-8689  
Margaret.rogers@arnoldporter.com

Laura S. Shores  
Saul P. Morgenstern  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE  
SCHOLER LLP  
601 Massachusetts Avenue  
Washington, DC 20001  
Telephone: (202) 942-5000  
laura.shores@arnoldporter.com  
saul.morgenstern@arnoldporter.com

*Counsel for Defendants Sandoz Inc. and  
Fougera Pharmaceuticals Inc.*

/s/ Roger B. Kaplan

Roger B. Kaplan  
Jason Kislin  
Aaron Van Nostrand  
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
500 Campus Drive, Suite 400  
Florham Park, NJ 07931  
Tel: (973) 360-7900  
Fax: (973) 295-1257  
kaplanr@gtlaw.com  
kislinj@gtlaw.com  
vannostranda@gtlaw.com

Brian T. Feeney  
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
1717 Arch Street, Suite 400  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Tel: (215) 988-7812  
Fax: (215) 717-5265  
feeneyb@gtlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Dr. Reddy's  
Laboratories, Inc.*

/s/ J. Clayton Everett, Jr.

J. Clayton Everett, Jr.  
William S.D. Cravens  
Neaha P. Raol  
Y. Frank Ren  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: +1.202.739.3000  
Facsimile: +1.202.739.3001  
clay.everett@morganlewis.com  
william.cravens@morganlewis.com  
neaha.raol@morganlewis.com  
frank.ren@morganlewis.com

Molly R. Maidman  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
One Federal Street  
Boston, MA 02110  
Telephone: +1.617.341.7996  
Facsimile: +1.617.341.7701  
molly.maidman@morganlewis.com

Harvey Bartle IV  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
1701 Market Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: +1.215.963.5000  
Facsimile: +1.215.963.5001  
harvey.bartle@morganlewis.com

*Counsel for Defendant Perrigo New York, Inc.*

/s/ Dimitria Doufekias  
Dimitria Doufekias  
Megan E. Gerking  
Robert W. Manoso  
Alexa Rae DiCunzolo  
MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
2100 L Street, NW Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20037  
Tel.: (202) 887-1500  
Fax: (202) 887-0763  
ddoufekias@mofo.com  
mgerking@mofo.com  
rmanoso@mofo.com  
adicunzolo@mofo.com

Michael B. Miller  
MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
250 W 55th Street  
New York, NY 10019  
Tel.: (212) 468-8000  
Fax: (212) 468-7900  
mbmiller@mofo.com

*Counsel for Defendant Glenmark  
Pharmaceuticals, Inc., USA*

/s/ John M. Taladay  
John M. Taladay  
Erik T. Koons  
Stacy L. Turner  
Christopher P. Wilson  
BAKER BOTTS LLP  
700 K Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: (202) 639-7700  
Facsimile: (202) 639-7890  
john.taladay@bakerbotts.com  
erik.koons@bakerbotts.com  
stacy.turner@bakerbotts.com  
christopher.wilson@bakerbotts.com

Lauri A. Kavulich  
Ann E. Lemmo  
CLARK HILL PLC  
2001 Market St, Suite 2620  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (215) 640-8500  
Facsimile: (215) 640-8501  
lkavulich@clarkhill.com  
alemmono@clarkhill.com

Lindsay S. Fouse  
CLARK HILL PLC  
301 Grant St, 14th Floor  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
Telephone: (412) 394-7711  
Facsimile: (412) 394-2555  
lfouse@clarkhill.com

*Counsel for Defendants Sun  
Pharmaceutical Industries, Inc. and Taro  
Pharmaceuticals U.S.A., Inc*



/s/ Ilana H. Eisenstein

Ilana H. Eisenstein  
Whitney Cloud  
Ben C. Fabens-Lassen  
DLA PIPER LLP (US)  
1650 Market Street, Suite 5000  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (215) 656-3300  
ilana.eisenstein@dlapiper.com  
whitney.cloud@dlapiper.com  
ben.fabens-lassen@dlapiper.com

Edward S. Scheidman  
DLA PIPER LLP (US)  
500 Eighth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: (202) 799-4000  
Edward.scheidman@dlapiper.com

*Counsel for Defendant Pfizer Inc. and  
Greenstone, LLC*

/s/ Marguerite M. Sullivan

Marguerite M. Sullivan  
Anna M. Rathbun  
LATHAM & WATKINS LLP  
555 Eleventh Street, NW  
Suite 1000  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 637-2200  
Fax: (202) 637-2201  
marguerite.sullivan@lw.com  
anna.rathbun@lw.com

*Counsel for Defendant G&W  
Laboratories*

/s/ Colin R. Kass

Colin R. Kass  
Proskauer Rose LLP  
1001 Pennsylvania Ave, NW  
Suite 600 South  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: (202) 416-6890  
Facsimile: (202) 416-6899

/s/ Jay P. Lefkowitz

Jay P. Lefkowitz, P.C.  
Devora W. Allon, P.C.  
Alexia R. Brancato  
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
601 Lexington Avenue  
New York, New York 10022  
(212) 909-3344  
lefkowitz@kirkland.com  
devora.allon@kirkland.com  
alexia.brancato@kirkland.com

*Counsel for Defendant Upsher-Smith  
Laboratories, LLC*

/s/ Damon W. Suden

William A. Escobar  
Damon W. Suden  
Clifford Katz  
KELLEY DRYE & WARREN LLP  
3 World Trade Center  
175 Greenwich Street  
New York, NY 10007  
Telephone: (212) 808-7800  
Facsimile: (212) 808-7987  
wescobar@kelleydrye.com  
dsuden@kelleydrye.com  
ckatz@kelleydrye.com

*Counsel for Defendant Wockhardt USA LLC*

/s/ Jason R. Parish

Jason R. Parish  
BUCHANAN INGERSOLL & ROONEY PC  
1700 K Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 452-7900  
Fax: (202) 452-7989

ckass@proskauer.com

Bradley I. Ruskin  
David A. Munkittrick  
Proskauer Rose LLP  
Eleven Times Square  
New York, New York 10036  
Telephone: (212) 969-3000  
Facsimile: (212) 969-2900  
bruskin@proskauer.com  
dmunkittrick@proskauer.com

Leiv Blad  
Meg Slachetka  
COMPETITION LAW PARTNERS  
1101 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: (202) 742-4300  
meg@competitionlawpartners.com  
leiv@competitionlawpartners.com

*Attorneys for Lupin Pharmaceuticals,  
Inc.*

/s/ Brian J. Smith  
Michael Martinez  
Steven Kowal  
Lauren Norris Donahue  
Brian J. Smith  
K&L GATES LLP  
70 W. Madison St., Suite 3300  
Chicago, IL 60602  
Tel. 312-372-1121  
Fax 312-827-8000  
michael.martinez@klgates.com  
steven.kowal@klgates.com  
lauren.donahue@klgates.com  
brian.j.smith@klgates.com

*Counsel for Defendant Mayne Pharma  
Inc.*

Bradley J. Kitlowski  
BUCHANAN INGERSOLL & ROONEY PC  
Union Trust Building  
501 Grant Street  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
Telephone: (412) 562-8800  
Fax: (412) 562-1041

*Counsel for Defendant Zydus Pharmaceuticals  
(USA) Inc.*

/s/ Chul Pak  
Chul Pak  
WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI  
Professional Corporation  
1301 Avenue of the Americas, 40th Floor  
New York, New York 10019  
Telephone: (212) 999-5800  
Facsimile: (212) 999-5899  
cpak@wsgr.com

Seth C. Silber  
Jeffrey C. Bank  
WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI  
Professional Corporation  
1700 K Street, NW, 5th Floor  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Telephone: (202) 973-8800  
Facsimile: (202) 973-8899  
ssilber@wsgr.com  
jbank@wsgr.com

Benjamin F. Holt

Adam K. Levin  
Justin W. Bernick  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
555 Thirteenth Street, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Telephone: (202) 637-5600  
benjamin.holt@hoganlovells.com  
adam.levin@hoganlovells.com  
justin.bernick@hoganlovells.com

Jasmeet K. Ahuja  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
1735 Market Street, 23rd Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (267) 675-4600  
jasmeet.ahuja@hoganlovells.com

*Counsel for Defendants Mylan Pharmaceuticals  
Inc. and Mylan Inc*

/s/ L. Barrett Boss

L. Barrett Boss  
S. Rebecca Brodey  
Thomas J. Ingalls  
COZEN O'CONNOR P.C.  
1200 19th Street NW, Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: (202) 912-4814  
Facsimile: (866) 413-0172  
bboss@cozen.com  
rbrodey@cozen.com  
tingalls@cozen.com

Peter M. Ryan  
COZEN O'CONNOR P.C.  
One Liberty Place  
1650 Market Street, Suite 2800  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (215) 665-2130  
Facsimile: (215) 701-2157  
pryan@cozen.com

*Counsel for Defendant James Nesta*